

## **SCRUTINY BOARD (CITY DEVELOPMENT)**

**TUESDAY, 11TH JANUARY, 2011**

**PRESENT:** Councillor J Procter in the Chair

Councillors J Akhtar, D Atkinson,  
B Cleasby, J Elliott, P Grahame, G Harper,  
J Jarosz, M Lobley, R Pryke, M Rafique  
and M Robinson

B Woroncow (Co-optee)

### **92 Chair's Opening Remarks**

The Chair welcomed everyone to the January meeting of the Scrutiny Board (City Development).

### **93 Late Items**

The Chair agreed to accept the following documents as supplementary information:-

- Letter from the Yorkshire and Humber Campaigner, Friends of the Earth regarding the issue of surface access to the airport (Agenda Item 8) (Minute 98 refers)
- Kirkgate Market Inquiry Session 2 – Towards a Strategy for Kirkgate Market: evidence base (Appendix 5) (Agenda Item 9) (Minute 99 refers)
- Friends of Leeds Kirkgate Market – Submission to City Development Scrutiny Board 'Market Inquiry' (Agenda Item 9) (Minute 99 refers)

The documents were not available at the time of the agenda despatch, but made available on the Council's Internet site prior to the meeting.

### **94 Declaration of Interests**

The following personal interests were declared at the meeting:-

- Councillor P Grahame in her capacity as a Member on the Leeds Bradford International Airport Joint Consultative Committee (Agenda Item 8) (Minute 98 refers)
- Councillor J Akhtar in his capacity as a private hire driver and as a Member on Plans Panel (West) (Agenda Item 8) (Minute 98 refers)
- Councillor J Procter in his capacity as a General Manager and Director of a company which provided facilities management services (Agenda Item 9) (Minute 99 refers)
- Councillor M Lobley in his capacity as Chairman of Re'newal Leeds Limited (Agenda Item 10) (Minute 100 refers)

- Councillor R Pryke in his capacity as a Member (Council representative) of Care and Repair (Leeds) (Agenda Item 10)(Minute 100 refers)
- Councillor M Rafique in his capacity as a Board Member of REEMAP (Agenda Item 10) (Minute 100 refers)
- Barbara Woroncow in her capacity as a Member of a Judging Panel on behalf of Welcome to Yorkshire (Agenda Item 7)(Minute 97 refers)

**95 Apologies for Absence and Notification of Substitutes**

Apologies for absence were received on behalf of Councillor B Atha and Councillor S Smith.

Notification had been received for Councillor P Grahame to substitute for Councillor B Atha and for Councillor B Cleasby to substitute for Councillor S Smith.

**96 Minutes of the Previous Meeting**

**RESOLVED** – That the minutes of the meeting held on 7<sup>th</sup> December 2010 be confirmed as a correct record.

**97 Welcome to Yorkshire**

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report on the attendance of Mr Gary Verity, Chief Executive of Welcome to Yorkshire, who had been invited to attend today's Board meeting to talk about the work of his organisation which included details of his work programme, action plan and budget.

The following representatives were in attendance who responded to Members' queries and comments:-

Gary Verity, Chief Executive of Welcome to Yorkshire  
 Claire Morrow, Chair of Welcome to Yorkshire  
 Peter Myers, Area Director, West Yorkshire, Welcome to Yorkshire  
 Martin Farrington, Acting Director of City Development

The Board received a short dvd and Powerpoint presentation by the Chief Executive of Welcome to Yorkshire and then had an opportunity for Members to discuss any issues that arose and ask questions.

A copy of a fact sheet and folder on news articles were tabled for Members information during consideration of this item.

The Powerpoint presentation covered the following specific areas:-

- Visitor economy and employment figures
- The operating model harness support from the private, public and third sectors
- Subscription and direct investment figures

- Yorkshire campaigns direct investment details in relation to gardens (including reference to Harewood; Lotherton Hall; Roundhay and Temple Newsam); golf; international; bus and boat; business engagement; events and festivals; business tourism and Yorkshire Gold)
- Leeds visitor economy figures over the last two years
- Future plans
- Questions

In summary, specific reference was made to the following issues:-

- BBC 'Frankenstein' filming in Manchester and clarification of the plans in place with regards to promoting Leeds as a place for filming drama series
- the suggestion that Welcome to Yorkshire had not promoted the Leeds Carnival and Leeds MELA or the Chinese and mixed communities  
*(The Chief Executive of Welcome to Yorkshire responded and confirmed that the organisation was very conscious about cultural diversity and expounded on the work undertaken by his organisation in this area. He offered to make available to the Board another dvd which focused specifically on the cultural diversity of Yorkshire and did promote the events referred to)*
- clarification of the working relationship between Marketing Leeds and Welcome to Yorkshire in promoting Leeds as a city
- clarification of the role of Welcome to Yorkshire in relation to 'Year of Volunteering Europe'
- clarification of the funding element of Welcome to Yorkshire and on the proportion of revenue that was received from the Council  
*(The Chair of Welcome to Yorkshire responded and agreed to provide a breakdown of the funding element to the Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser for circulation to Board Members)*
- clarification of the plans in place to promote Leeds in America
- an invitation to Welcome to Yorkshire to visit Lineham Farm and support the excellent work being undertaken for disadvantaged children

#### **RESOLVED-**

- a) That the report together with the short dvd, and power point presentation from the Chief Executive of Welcome to Yorkshire, be received and noted.
- b) That a vote of thanks be conveyed to the Chief Executive of Welcome to Yorkshire and his colleagues for their attendance and contribution to the meeting.
- c) That a copy of the powerpoint slides used during the presentation be circulated to the Board.
- d) That no further scrutiny be undertaken on this issue.

(Councillors D Atkinson and J Elliot joined the meeting at 10.15am during discussions of the above item)

**98 Leeds Bradford International Airport: Surface Access**

Referring to Minute 18 of the meeting held on 6<sup>th</sup> July 2010, the Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report on the surface access strategy and other transport related planning issues at Leeds Bradford International Airport.

Appended to the report were copies of the following documents for the information/comment of the meeting:-

- Leeds Bradford International Airport: Surface Access – Report of the Acting Director of City Development
- Leeds Bradford International Airport Surface Access Strategy – Summary (Appendix A refers)
- Leeds City Region Partners – Leeds City Region Transport Strategy – Executive Summary (Appendix B refers)
- UK airports ranked by Million Passengers per Annum (Appendix C refers)
- Leeds City Council Scrutiny Board Meeting – 11<sup>th</sup> January 2011 – Presentation slides provided by Leeds Bradford International Airport (Appendix D refers)

In addition to the above appendices, Members also received a briefing note on the Surface Access Strategy from Simon Bowens, Yorkshire and Humber Campaigner, Friends of the Earth which had been circulated as supplementary information prior to the Board meeting.

The following representatives, Elected Members and officers were in attendance and responded to Board Members' queries and comments:-

John Parkin, Chief Executive, Leeds Bradford International Airport  
Carl Lapworth, Director, Operations & Engineering, Leeds Bradford International Airport  
David Hoggarth, Director, Development, Metro  
Martin Farrington, Acting Director of City Development  
Andrew Hall, Acting Head of Transport Policy, City Development  
Councillor C Campbell, Otley and Yeadon Ward Member

The Chair invited Martin Farrington, Acting Director of City Development to give a brief overview of the role of Leeds Bradford International Airport within the city region.

Following this, the Chair then invited John Parkin, Chief Executive of Leeds Bradford International Airport to comment on the aims and objectives as outlined within the document entitled 'Bridgepoint 3 – Point Strategy – A clear vision for the future success of Leeds Bradford International Airport'.

The Board then focused on the Leeds Bradford International Airport surface access strategy and other transport related planning issues.

Andrew Hall, Acting Head of Transport, City Development highlighted the main issues within the department's report, together with input from John Parkin, Chief Executive of Leeds Bradford International Airport; Carl Lapworth, Director, Operations and Engineering, Leeds Bradford International Airport and David Hoggarth, Director, Development, Metro.

In addition to the above representations, the Chair also invited Councillors C Campbell to briefly comment on this issue. Councillor Campbell stated that he was not against the airport and that it did make a very significant contribution to the regional economy. However he had concerns about the major impact on the traffic infrastructure should the airport expand its operation to 6 million passengers a year. He also made reference to the lack of Government funding in this area, the large number of vehicles that were using inappropriate roads when accessing the airport and current drop off and pick up issues. He thought that it was time for a more realistic surface access strategy that tried to address the increasing traffic issues facing the airport's operation that did not rely on expensive schemes that were not likely to get the go ahead in the current economic climate.

The Board Members then questioned the above representatives and officers on the main points.

In summary, specific reference was made to the following issues:-

- clarification of the figures in relation to the distribution of passengers using Leeds Bradford International Airport
- clarification as to which body was responsible for producing a new airport Surface Access Strategy  
*(The Acting Head of Transport Policy responded and informed the meeting that it was the ultimate responsibility of Leeds Bradford International airport, in consultation with other partners i.e. Highways, Metro etc)*
- the concerns raised about the out of date post code navigation system that existed on the airport's website which directed airport traffic on inappropriate roads  
*(The Acting Head of Transport Policy responded and confirmed that satellite navigation was a problem as it was difficult to ascertain what highway route network information had been referred to satellite navigation companies)*
- clarification of the number of airport's flight movements compared to those at Robin Hood Airport and whether or not it was the airport's intention to construct a second runway  
*(The Chief Executive of Leeds Bradford International Airport responded and confirmed that there was no physical space at the airport to construct a second runway and no demand requirement to meet the airport's forecast growth)*

- clarification of the airport's vision to implement routes to Canada via British Airways  
*(The Chief Executive of Leeds Bradford International Airport responded and outlined the current protocol for long distance flights. The Board noted that in the interests of putting Yorkshire on the tourist map and bringing in more trade, the airport wanted to expand it's routes to other cities in Germany)*
- concerns about disability access at the airport  
*(The Director of Operations and Engineering, Leeds Bradford International Airport responded and outlined the procedures in place and access points for disabled cars which conform to the Disability Discrimination Act 2004)*
- clarification of the tendering process for the taxi contract  
*(The Director of Operations and Engineering, Leeds Bradford International Airport responded that the taxi contract was due for renewal in two years time)*
- the view that some parts of the airport looked untidy and unclean and that the private hire box was in need of urgent repair  
*(The Director of Operations and Engineering, Leeds Bradford International Airport responded and explained the need for a 30m exclusion zone around the airport terminal and that once the new terminal building was complete the private hire box would be relocated)*
- clarification as why seasonal flights were often withdrawn completely in the Winter rather continue with less frequent flights  
*(The Chief Executive of Leeds Bradford International Airport responded and outlined the criteria for the economic viability of seasonal flights which ensured that airlines did not operate at a loss)*

#### **RESOLVED-**

- a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.
- b) That the Acting Director of City Development submit a report to the next meeting on the planning obligations the Leeds Bradford International Airport had in relation to surface access at the airport.
- c) That details be provided to the Board on the information the Council had passed to Satellite Navigation companies on how to get to Leeds Bradford International Airport.

(Councillor D Atkinson left the meeting at 12.10pm during discussions of the above item)

#### **99 Kirkgate Market Inquiry Session 2**

Referring to Minute 85 of the meeting held on 7<sup>th</sup> December 2010, the Acting Director of City Development submitted a report on the second session of the Board's Inquiry to Consider the Future of Kirkgate Market.

Appended to the report were copies of the following documents for the information/comment of the meeting:-

- Extract from Valuation Office Agency Report (Appendix 1 refers)
- Background information regarding building condition surveys (Appendix 2 refers)
- Service chargeable and non service chargeable costs (Appendix 3 refers)
- Breakdown of 2010/Service Charge (Appendix 4 refers)

In addition to the above appendices, copies of the following documents were also submitted as supplementary information:-

- Towards a Strategy for Kirkgate Market: evidence base (Appendix 5 refers)
- Friends of Leeds Kirkgate Market – Submission to City Development Scrutiny Board ‘Market Inquiry’ – 11<sup>th</sup> January 2010

The following representatives/witnesses were in attendance and gave evidence to the Board and responded to Board Members’ queries and comments:-

Martin Farrington, Acting Director of City Development  
 Paul Stephens, Chief Economic Development Officer, City Development  
 Cath Follin, Head of City Centre and Markets, City Development  
 Joe Williams, National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF) (Kirkgate Branch)  
 Liz Laughton, National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF) (Kirkgate Branch)  
 Michele Hocken, National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF) (Kirkgate Branch)  
 Lacky Singh, National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF) (Kirkgate Branch)  
 John Perriton, National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF)  
 Alan Wheeldon, Friends of Kirkgate Market

The Chair referred to a recent report entitled ‘Towards a Market Strategy for Kirkgate Market’ which had been presented to the Executive Board meeting on 15<sup>th</sup> December 2010. On behalf of the meeting, he raised the dissatisfaction of Board Members that officers had not referred to the existence of this report at the last Board meeting. He also highlighted the fact that the department’s report to Executive Board made no reference to this Board’s inquiry and that the Executive Board had already taken a decision to freeze market rents.

The Chair then invited the Chief Economic Development Officer and the Head of City Centre and Markets to give a brief introduction on the following key points referred to in the report :-

- Rent Review
- Condition surveys
- Service Charges
- Stall lettings policy
- Management of Ownership models
- The Association of British Market Authorities

Following this, the Chair then allowed Joe Williams, National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF) (Kirkgate Branch) to comment on a new strategy for Kirkgate Market.

In her presentation, she referred to the main points of concern identified in the document entitled 'Friends of Leeds Kirkgate Market – Submission to City Development Scrutiny Board 'Market Inquiry' – 11<sup>th</sup> January 2010'.

The Board specifically noted that elements of the Market buildings were in a poor condition and that immediate investment of £1.8m was needed for work in the next two years.

In concluding, she requested Board Members to note the points of concern.

At the request of the Chair, the Acting Director of City Development responded to the individual comments made. He informed the meeting that the department was keen to go through a consultation process on the future of the market with the aim of exploring management and ownership models with market traders and other stakeholders. He also welcomed the views of Board Members in further exploring the delivery of a long term sustainable strategy.

Board Members then questioned officers and witnesses on the main points.

In summary, specific reference was made to the following issues raised by Friends of Kirkgate Market:-

- the concerns raised about the consultation process to date and the need for Elected Members and traders to be engaged with that process. It was pointed out that Members of the Scrutiny Board had not seen the consultation document which had been circulated to traders
- that there was an urgent need for progress on developing a strategy for the market
- clarification of the figure of £2.4m in relation to backlog maintenance
- the concerns raised that no progress had been made in developing a market strategy since the Scrutiny Board's initial visit to the market in August 2010
- a view that a Markets Committee should be developed to manage the market
- the concerns raised that the report today failed to address the parking issues around the market as this was an essential element for the market's future

*(The Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser reminded the meeting that a report on parking issues in the Eastgate Development would be considered at the next meeting in February 2011)*

- clarification of the views of market traders as to whether or not it was an important factor for the Council to be involved in the future of the market  
*(A representative from the National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF) (Kirkgate Branch) responded and commented that in their view the Council should be involved as the landlord with market traders leading on its day to day operation)*
- the need for a further report that expands the current management and ownership models that were detailed in today's report and for the Acting Director of City Development to consult with traders on their preferred model for consideration at the next Board meeting in February  
*(The Acting Director of City Development stated that he would come back to the Chair if this timescale was not achievable)*
- the need for the department to be more open and transparent with traders concerning issues around service charges and structural reports

The Chair then allowed further representation from Michelle Hocken and Lacky Singh, National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF) (Kirkgate Branch); Liz Laughton, National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF) (Kirkgate Branch); John Perriton, National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF) and Alan Wheeldon, Friends of Kirkgate Market.

In summary, specific reference was made to the following issues made by the National Market Traders Federation:-

- the concerns expressed about the lack of up to date information contained in management reports
- the need for officers to prioritise works needed to the building in consultation with the traders
- the need for the building survey/ structural details to be made public  
*(The Head of City Centre and Markets, City Development responded and agreed to forward a copy of the relevant documents to market traders by 14<sup>th</sup> January 2011)*
- that a detailed breakdown of service charges income and expenditure should be made accessible to traders on a daily basis
- an offer by a representative of NMTF to provide a copy of a Market private partnership survey  
*(The Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser agreed to follow up this issue with Friends of Kirkgate Market representative)*

In concluding, the Chair, on behalf of the Board, thanked officers and witnesses for their attendance and contribution to the Inquiry.

#### **RESOLVED-**

- a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.
- b) That the Acting Director of City Development expands the current management and ownership models that were detailed in today's

report and that he consult with traders on their preferred model for consideration at the next Board meeting on 8th February 2010

- c) That the parking issues and provision in the Eastgate Development be also incorporated within that report.
- d) That the relevant issues identified at today's meeting be incorporated in to the Board's draft final report and recommendations on the future of Kirkgate Market.

(Councillor M Rafique left the meeting at 1.15pm during discussions of the above item)

(Councillor M Lobley left the meeting at 1.50pm during discussions of the above item)

(Councillors G Harper and J Elliott left the meeting at 2.05pm at the conclusion of the above item)

#### **100 Initial Budget Proposals by the Executive Board for 2011/12**

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report on the Executive Board's initial budget proposals in so far as it related to the duties and responsibilities with regards to the City Development department.

It was noted that any comments or recommendations made by this Board had to be submitted to the Director of Resources no later than 20<sup>th</sup> January 2011 in order that the Executive Board could consider proposals for the 2011/12 budget at its meeting on 11<sup>th</sup> February prior to submission to full Council on the 23<sup>rd</sup> February 2011.

Appended to the report was a copy of a report entitled ' Initial Budget Proposals – Executive Board – 15<sup>th</sup> December 2010 – Report of the Director of Resources' for the information/comment of the meeting.

The following representatives were in attendance and responded to Members' queries and comments:-

Martin Farrington, Acting Director of City Development  
Catherine Blanchard, Chief Officer, Libraries, Arts and Heritage, City Development  
Richard Mond, Chief Recreation Officer, City Development  
Gary Bartlett, Chief Officer, Highways and Transportation, City Development  
Ed Mylan, Chief Officer, Resources and Strategy, City Development  
Simon Criddle, Head of Finance, City Development

The Board noted that Councillor R Lewis, Executive Board Member for Development and Regeneration had conveyed his apologies for this item. and Councillor A Ogilvie, Executive Board Member for Leisure had attended the meeting at the required time, but the meeting had run late and he had had to leave to attend a funeral.

At the request of the Chair, the Acting Director, City Development introduced the report of the Director of Resources in relation to his Directorate and highlighted the key issues/areas of concern.

Board Members then questioned the above representatives and commented on the specific proposals relevant to the City Development department.

In summary, specific reference was made to the following issues:-

- clarification of when Board Members would be able to see the final budget proposals relating to the City Development department  
*(The Chief Officer, Resources and Strategy responded and agreed to consult with the Director of Resources, but that it would likely be when the Executive Board papers were released for the Executive Board's budget meeting on 11<sup>th</sup> February 2011)*
- clarification of the latest position and numbers in relation to the Early Leaver Initiative and the concerns expressed about deleting posts which were filled by experienced staff
- request to identify the three sport centres which were going to be proposed for closure and the need for the Board to comment on this proposal prior to a final decision being made  
*(The Acting Director of City Development was not able to comment at this stage prior to publication of the February budget papers)*
- clarification as to whether the review of Libraries had had an impact on services and the concerns expressed that staff were not being consulted on the proposals
- clarification of the future of the 'free' city bus service
- clarification of whether or not the budget for gritting was to be cut from the highway maintenance budget  
*(The Chief Officer, Highways and Transportation responded and confirmed that there would be no reduction in the gritting budget for 2011/12)*
- a request for a report on the back log of pothole repairs arising from the recent adverse weather  
*(The Chief Officer, Highways and Transportation agreed to supply this report)*
- clarification of what was being proposed to achieve street lighting savings
- request for details of the grants allocation reduction which was referred to the Scrutiny Board Grants Working Group
- details of income and expenditure were requested for Temple Newsam House the House, shop, ticketing, and car park
- a request for Board Members to be provided with base costs and savings arising from the withdrawal of all farming activities at Temple Newsam  
*(The Chief Recreation Officer responded and agreed to supply this information via the Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser)*

- clarification of the 'knock on' effects arising from the above proposals in relation to Party in the Park/Opera in the Park at Temple Newsam
- the need for the Board to be supplied with details of Museums shops showing profit/loses  
*(The Chief Officer, Libraries, Arts and Heritage responded and agreed to supply this information via the Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser)*
- the need for the Board to be supplied with a list of events to include costings; whether or not they were chargeable and on any savings made  
*(The Chief Officer, Libraries, Arts and Heritage responded and agreed to supply this information via the Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser)*

**RESOLVED-**

- a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.
- b) That the Board was not able to make any specific recommendations back to the Executive Board on its initial budget proposals as it had insufficient information on which to base any proposals by the deadline imposed of 20<sup>th</sup> January 2011.
- c) That the Acting Director of City Development submit a report to the Board's next meeting on the backlog of road repairs following the recent bad weather.
- d) That the Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser seek the further information requested on the initial budget proposals from the Acting Director of City Development for submission to Board Members.

(Councillor J Akthar left the meeting at 3.05pm at the conclusion of the above item)

**101 City Development Directorate 2011/12 Budget Financial Position  
Period 8**

Referring to Minute 86 of the meeting held on 7<sup>th</sup> December 2010, the Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report providing the Board with a financial position for the City Development Directorate at period 8.

Appended to the report was a copy of a document entitled ' City Development Directorate; 2010/Budget – Period 8 Report for the information/comment of the meeting.

The following representatives were in attendance and responded to Members' queries and comments:-

Martin Farrington, Acting Director of City Development  
Ed Mylan, Chief Officer, Resources and Strategy, City Development  
Simon Criddle, Head of Finance, City Development

**RESOLVED** - That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.

**102 Work Programme, Executive Board Minutes and Forward Plan of Key Decisions**

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report providing Members with a copy of the Board's current Work Programme. The Executive Board minutes of 15<sup>th</sup> December 2010, together with the Forward Plan of Key Decisions for the period 1<sup>st</sup> December 2010 to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2011 were also attached to the report.

**RESOLVED-**

- a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.
- b) That the Executive Board minutes of 15<sup>th</sup> December 2010, together with the Forward Plan of Key Decisions for the period 1<sup>st</sup> December 2010 to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2011 be noted.
- c) That the Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser be requested to update the work programme as follows:-
  - Leeds Bradford International Airport – report on the planning obligations the Leeds Bradford International Airport had in relation to surface access at the airport (February 2011)
  - Kirkgate Market – Session 3 of the Board's Inquiry - add parking issues and provision in the Eastgate Development expansion of the current management and ownership models having consulted with traders on their preferred model (February 2011)
  - report on the backlog of road repairs following the recent bad weather (February 2011)

**103 Date and Time of Next Meeting**

Tuesday 8<sup>th</sup> February 2011 at 10.00am (Pre meeting for Board Members at 9.30am)

(The meeting concluded at 3.15pm)